REBECCA TUSHNET 600 New Jersey Avenue NW Washington, DC 20001)))
Plaintiff,)) Civil Action No
v.)
UNITED STATES IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT 500 12th Street NW Washington, DC 20536))))
Defendant.)))

COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

1. Plaintiff Rebecca Tushnet brings this action to compel Defendant United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement to produce records under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 U.S.C. § 552, et seq.

JURISDICTION

2. This Court has jurisdiction under 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B).

PARTIES

- 3. Plaintiff Rebecca Tushnet is a professor and intellectual property scholar at Georgetown University Law Center. Professor Tushnet, through counsel, made the FOIA request at issue in this action.
- 4. Defendant United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) is a component of the U.S. Department of Homeland Security. ICE is an agency of the United

States government and has possession of records responsive to Professor Tushnet's FOIA request.

FACTS

- 5. On March 6, 2015, Professor Tushnet, through counsel, submitted a FOIA request to ICE's Freedom of Information Act Office by first-class mail and email.
- 6. In her FOIA request, Professor Tushnet sought:
 - All images and descriptions of clothing seized or impounded by ICE as counterfeit from 2012 to the date of the request.
 - 2) All records, guidelines, policies, procedures, or training documents that describe how ICE:
 - a. determines how similar one mark must be to another to deem an item bearing a mark counterfeit;
 - distinguishes between items that are merely infringing items and items that are counterfeit;
 - c. uses or considers circuit-specific case law in determining whether an item is counterfeit or infringing;
 - d. considers the legal doctrine of fair use in determining whether an item is counterfeit or infringing;
 - e. considers trademark-infringement defenses other than fair use in determining whether an item is counterfeit or infringing.
 - 3) All records that use the words "disparagement," "parody," "distortion," or "tarnishment," or grammatical variants thereof, in connection with trademark rights holders' requests or consultations with trademark rights holders.

- 4) All records indicating that an item was seized by ICE, in whole or in part, because the item disparaged, parodied, distorted, or tarnished a trademark.
- 5) All documents, presentations, handouts, and photographs used by ICE in connection with the ICE news conference on counterfeit clothing held the week of January 25, 2015-January 31, 2015, which is described in the article "US agents tackle fake Super Bowl items," written by Nestor Ramos and in Globe 31, 2015. published the Boston on January See http://www.bostonglobe.com/metro/2015/01/31/searching-for-tom-bardyfeds-hunt-counterfeiters-before-big-game/SusU4CTQW5nfEC0wvLvkIM /story.html.
- 6) All records referencing Daniel Modricker's paraphrased statement at the news conference described in request number 5 that "[t]he profane debasing of a mascot—and really anything that denigrates a team—is guaranteed to be contraband," including any records reflecting his exact words.
- 7. Pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(A)(iii) and 6 C.F.R. § 5.11(k), Professor Tushnet sought a waiver of all fees associated with her request because disclosure of the requested records is in the public interest and not in Professor Tushnet's commercial interest.
- 8. On March 6, 2015, the ICE FOIA office sent an automatically-generated email reply indicating that it had received Professor Tushnet's emailed FOIA request.
- 9. On March 18, 2015, the ICE FOIA office sent a letter by email to Professor Tushnet's counsel acknowledging receipt of Professor Tushnet's FOIA request and assigning it reference number 2015-ICFO-74241. The ICE FOIA office further stated that although it is ICE's goal to respond to FOIA requests within twenty business days, it was

taking a ten-day extension pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(B) because the request "seeks numerous documents that will necessitate a thorough and wide-ranging search."

- 10. In its letter of March 18, 2015, the ICE FOIA office stated that it was denying Professor Tushnet's request for a waiver of all applicable fees, and it provided Professor Tushnet with notice of her right to an administrative appeal. By letter of April 28, 2015, Professor Tushnet, through counsel, appealed the denial of her request for a blanket waiver of all FOIA processing fees. By letter of May 7, 2015, the Government Information Law Division of ICE's Office of the Principal Legal Advisor acknowledged receipt of Professor Tushnet's administrative appeal and assigned it reference number 2015-ICAP-00353. By letter of June 4, 2015, ICE announced that, after considering the information provided in Professor Tushnet's appeal, ICE had determined that her fee waiver request should be granted.
- 11. On March 19, 2015, the ICE FOIA office sent an email to Professor Tushnet's counsel stating that it had determined that the request "is too broad in scope, did not specifically identify the records which you are seeking, or only posed questions to the agency." The ICE FOIA office requested that Professor Tushnet resubmit her request with a "reasonable description" of the records sought, and stated that if Professor Tushnet did not respond within ten days, ICE would assume that Professor Tushnet was no longer interested in her FOIA request, and the case would be administratively closed. Professor Tushnet, through counsel, responded by letter of March 27, 2015, advising ICE that (1) she remained interested in her FOIA request; (2) the case should not be administratively closed; (3) the request did not ask ICE to create new records; (4) the request did not pose any questions to the agency; and (5) she sought only the release of

existing records that ICE has in its files. With regard to the specificity of her requests, Professor Tushnet explained that her original request reasonably described the records sought and that an ICE employee familiar with the subject area should be able to locate the responsive records with a reasonable amount of effort. Finally, Professor Tushnet provided a detailed explanation of each part of her FOIA request.

- 12. The Department of Homeland Security maintains a website that allows the public to check the status of an ICE FOIA request. According to that website, www.dhs.gov/foia-status, Request Number 2015-ICFO-74241 has an estimated delivery date of April 29, 2015.
- 13. On June 10, 2015, Professor Tushnet's counsel telephoned the ICE FOIA office to ascertain the status of Professor Tushnet's request. Professor Tushnet's counsel left a detailed voice message requesting a return phone call. As of the filing of this Complaint, the ICE FOIA office has not returned the call.
- 14. Pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(A)(i), ICE had twenty working days to respond substantively to Professor Tushnet's FOIA request. Even assuming that ICE was entitled to invoke a ten-day extension under 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(B), more than thirty working days have passed since ICE received Professor Tushnet's FOIA request of March 6, 2015, and ICE has not provided a substantive response.
- 15. Because Professor Tushnet has not received a substantive response to her FOIA request within the applicable time limit, pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(6)(C)(i), Professor Tushnet has exhausted her administrative remedies.

CLAIM FOR RELIEF

16. Professor Tushnet has a statutory right under FOIA, 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(3)(A), to the records she requested and no legal basis exists for ICE's failure to disclose them. ICE has constructively denied Professor Tushnet's FOIA request by failing to produce any records or provide a substantive response for over three months.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

Wherefore, Plaintiff requests that this Court:

- A. Declare that ICE's failure to provide the records responsive to Professor Tushnet's FOIA request is unlawful;
- B. Order ICE to make the requested records available to Professor Tushnet without delay;
- C. Award Professor Tushnet her litigation costs and reasonable attorneys' fees pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E); and
- D. Award all other appropriate relief.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Michael T. Kirkpatrick

Michael T. Kirkpatrick (DC Bar No. 486293) Meghan M. Boone (DC Bar No. 1006894) Institute for Public Representation Georgetown University Law Center 600 New Jersey Avenue NW, Suite 312 Washington, DC 20001

Phone: (202) 662-9546 Fax: (202) 662-9634

Email: michael.kirk patrick@law.georgetown.edu

mmb302@law.georgetown.edu

Dated: June 12, 2015 Attorneys for Plaintiff

CIVIL COVER SHEET

JS-44 (Rev. 7/13 DC)	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			DEFEND	NITO					
Rebecca Tushnet		DEFENDANTS UNITED STATES IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT								
(EX	CEPT IN U.S.	LISTED PLAINTIFF 11001 PLAINTIFF CASES)		COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES ONLY) NOTE: IN LAND CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF LAND INVOLVED						
Michael T. Kirkpati INSTITUTE FOR F 600 New Jersey A Washington, DC 2	rick (DC B PUBLIC R venue NW	EPRESENTATION		ATTORNEYS	S (IF KNOW	N)				
II. BASIS OF JURIS (PLACE AN x IN ONE								ES (PLACE AN x IN ONE IVERSITY CASES ONLY!	BOX FOR	DFT
O 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff		ederal Question J.S. Government Not a Party)	Citizen of t	his State	O 1	O ₁		orated or Principal Place	O 4	O 4
2 U.S. Government Defendant	(Diversity Indicate Citizenship of	Citizen of	Another State	O 2	O 2	Incorpo	orated and Principal of Business in Another Sta	O 5	O 5
	F	arties in item III)	Citizen or S Foreign Co	Subject of a ountry	O 3	O 3	Foreign	n Nation	O 6	O 6
(Place an 1	X in one cat	IV. CASE ASSI egory, A-N, that best repre						esponding Nature of S	uit)	
O A. Antitrust	О в. н	Personal Injury/ Ialpractice		C. Adminis Review				O D. Temporary Order/Preli	Restrai	ning
410 Antitrust	315 Ai 320 As 330 Fe 340 M 345 M 350 M 355 M 360 O 362 M 365 Pr	irplane irplane Product Liability ssault, Libel & Slander ederal Employers Liability arine arine Product Liability otor Vehicle otor Vehicle Product Liability ther Personal Injury edical Malpractice roduct Liability ealth Care/Pharmaceutical ersonal Injury Product Liabili sbestos Product Liability	Other Statutes 891 Agricultural Acts 893 Environmental Matters 890 Other Statutory Actions (If Administrative Agency is		Any nature of suit from any category may be selected for this category of case assignment. *(If Antitrust, then A governs)*					
O E. General Civ	vil (Other)	OR	(F. Pro	Se Gene	ral Civ	il			
Real Property		C 157 er onditions	☐ 625 ☐ 690 Other St: ☐ 375 ☐ 400 ☐ 430 ☐ 450 ☐ 462 ☐ 462 ☐ 465 ☐ 470	e/Penalty Drug Rela Property 2 Other atutes False Clair State Rea Banks & H Commerce Rates/etc. Deportatic Naturaliza Applicatio Other Imp Actions Racketeer & Corrup	ms Act pportion Banking e/ICC on ntion n ingration	ment	480 Consumer C 490 Cable/Satelli 850 Securities/Co Exchange 896 Arbitration 899 Administrati Act/Review of Agency Deci 950 Constitution Statutes 890 Other Statut (if not admin	te TV ommodition or Appeal sion ality of St ory Action	lure of ate ns ngency	

Case 1:15-cv-00907 Document 1-1 Filed 06/12/15 Page 2 of 2

O G. Habeas Corpus/	O H. Employment	O I. FOIA/Privacy Act	O J. Student Loan		
2255 530 Habeas Corpus – General 510 Motion/Vacate Sentence 463 Habeas Corpus – Alien Detaince	Discrimination 442 Civil Rights – Employment (criteria: race, gender/sex, national origin, discrimination, disability, age, religion, retaliation)	■ 895 Freedom of Information Act ■ 890 Other Statutory Actions (if Privacy Act)	152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loan (excluding veterans)		
	(If pro se, select this deck)	*(If pro se, select this deck)*			
K. Labor/ERISA (non-employment) 710 Fair Labor Standards Act 720 Labor/Mgmt. Relations 740 Labor Railway Act 751 Family and Medical Leave Act 790 Other Labor Litigation 791 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act	L. Other Civil Rights (non-employment) 441 Voting (if not Voting Rights Act) 443 Housing/Accommodations 440 Other Civil Rights 445 Americans w/Disabilities – Employment 446 Americans w/Disabilities – Other 448 Education	M. Contract 110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument Enforcement of Judgment 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholder's Suits 190 Other Contracts 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise	O N. Three-Judge Court 441 Civil Rights – Voting (if Voting Rights Act)		
V. ORIGIN					
O 1 Original Proceeding 2 Removed from State Court	3 Remanded from Appellate Court 4 Reinstated or Reopened		ti-district		
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (CITE THE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH YOU ARE FILING AND WRITE A BRIEF STATEMENT OF CAUSE.) This is an action under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. 552, seeking the release of requested agency records.					
VII. REQUESTED IN CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23 DEMAND \$ COMPLAINT CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23 DEMAND \$ LONG YES Only if demanded in complaint YES NO X					
VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY	(See instruction) YES	NO X If yes, p	lease complete related case form		
DATE:June 12, 2015	SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF RE	cord Milal M	while		

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET JS-44 Authority for Civil Cover Sheet

The JS-44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and services of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. Listed below are tips for completing the civil cover sheet. These tips coincide with the Roman Numerals on the cover sheet.

- I. COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT (b) County of residence: Use 11001 to indicate plaintiff if resident of Washington, DC, 88888 if plaintiff is resident of United States but not Washington, DC, and 99999 if plaintiff is outside the United States.
- III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES: This section is completed only if diversity of citizenship was selected as the Basis of Jurisdiction under Section II.
- IV. CASE ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT: The assignment of a judge to your case will depend on the category you select that best represents the <u>primary</u> cause of action found in your complaint. You may select only <u>one</u> category. You <u>must</u> also select <u>one</u> corresponding nature of suit found under the category of the case.
- VI. CAUSE OF ACTION: Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of the primary cause.
- VIII. RELATED CASE(S), IF ANY: If you indicated that there is a related case, you must complete a related case form, which may be obtained from the Clerk's Office.

Because of the need for accurate and complete information, you should ensure the accuracy of the information provided prior to signing the form.

Rebecca Tushnet)
Plaintiff)
v.) Civil Action No.
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement	
Defendant	- <i>'</i>)
SUMMO	ONS IN A CIVIL ACTION
500 12th St	res Immigration and Customs Enforcement treet SW n, DC 20536
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached	mmons on you (not counting the day you received it) you must d complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and
Michael T. Kirkpatrick Institute for Public Represer Georgetown University Law 600 New Jersey Avenue NV Washington, DC 20001	Center
If you fail to respond, judgment by defacomplaint. You also must file your answer or	ault may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the motion with the court.
	ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
_{Date:} June 12, 2015	
	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

was re	This summons for (nan ceived by me on (date)	ne of individual and title, if any)			
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individual a	at (place)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence or u	· —	1 4	
			of suitable age and discretion who resid		
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to t	he individual's last known address; or		
		ons on (name of individual)		, who i	S
	designated by law to a	accept service of process on beha	If of (name of organization)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the summ	nons unexecuted because		; 0	r
	☐ Other (<i>specify</i>):				
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00	
	I declare under penalty	of perjury that this information	is true.		
Date:					
			Server's signature		
			Printed name and title		
			Server's address		-

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Rebecca Tushnet	
Plaintiff)
v.) Civil Action No.
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement)
Defendant	- ',)
SUMM	ONS IN A CIVIL ACTION
United Stat 950 Pennsy	eneral of the United States les Department of Justice ylvania Avenue NW n, DC 20530
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached	Center
If you fail to respond, judgment by deficomplaint. You also must file your answer or	ault may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the motion with the court.
	ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
_{Date:} June 12, 2015	
	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (no	ame of individual and title, if any)		
was rec	ceived by me on (date)			
	☐ I personally serve	d the summons on the individual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summon	s at the individual's residence or usual pl	ace of abode with (name)	
		, a person of suita	ble age and discretion who resid	les there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to the indi	ividual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	nons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process on behalf of (n		
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	nmons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
				0.00
	I declare under penal	lty of perjury that this information is true		
Date:				
			Server's signature	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Rebecca Tushnet)
Plaintiff)
v.) Civil Action No.
U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement)
Defendant)
SUMMO	NS IN A CIVIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and address) United States 555 4th Stree Washington,	
A lawsuit has been filed against you.	
serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached of	Center
If you fail to respond, judgment by defau complaint. You also must file your answer or m	ult may be entered against you for the relief demanded in the notion with the court.
	ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
Date: June 12, 2015	
	Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (no	ame of individual and title, if any)		
was rec	ceived by me on (date)			
	☐ I personally serve	d the summons on the individual at (place)	
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I left the summon	s at the individual's residence or usual pl	ace of abode with (name)	
		, a person of suita	ble age and discretion who resid	les there,
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to the indi	ividual's last known address; or	
	☐ I served the summ	nons on (name of individual)		, who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process on behalf of (n		
			on (date)	; or
	☐ I returned the sum	nmons unexecuted because		; or
	☐ Other (specify):			
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
				0.00
	I declare under penal	lty of perjury that this information is true		
Date:				
			Server's signature	
			Printed name and title	
			Server's address	

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc: